



Working Group 1 West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Tuesday 28 February 2012

09:00 - 11:00

CNPMEM - Paris

Summary of Recommendations and Actions

Chairman: Jane Sandell
Vice Chairman: Victor Badiola
Rapporteur: Kara Brydson

1. Welcome

The WG1 Vice Chairman, Víctor Badiola, took the chair as Chairman substituting Jane Sandell, who was not able to attend and sent her apologies. Mr. Badiola welcomed the members, the representatives of the Joint Nature Conservation Committee Tom Blasdale and Sophie Elliot, and the representatives of DG MARE – European Commission Roy Griffin and Laurent Markovic. The full list of attendees is included as an annex to these minutes.

- Apologies for absence were received from Jane Sandell, Hugo González, Paul Trebilcock and Caroline Gamblin. The full list of attendees is included as an annex to these minutes.
- Adoption of the agenda and the report of the last meeting: The agenda was adopted without comment, as was the report of the last meeting (Friday 28 October 2011, Dublin)

2. Review of the Cod Recovery Plan (EC Reg. 1342/2008)

Sean O'Donoghue reported back on the STECF scoping meeting for Impact Assessments of Multi-Annual Management Plans (MAMPs), specifically the review process of the Cod recovery plan. Sean represented the NWWRAC at this meeting held in Edinburgh in November, and had attended the first 2 days.

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



Sean reported that the main points raised at the meeting were:

- Looking into alternative methods of effort control;
- Considering the control elements of discards proposal in CFP reform - a conclusion was made that the discards proposal was unenforceable in practice;
- Options for Impact Assessment to be considered later this year, and a work plan on scientific, economic and social aspects will be drawn up;
- Recognition that the total fishing mortality, including outside fishing effort, should be considered: the Benchmark meeting WKROUND (in Aberdeen) will analyse other issues including seal predation;
- Consideration must be on total allowable catches (and discards) rather than landings.
- Multi-species modelling is not available for the West of Scotland.
- Integrating economic aspects in the management plan may be disproportionately costly so there are still questions over methodology.
- If assessment models change, there will be substantial knock-on effects for the whole process.

Sean reported that it was disappointing that the social elements of the review of the plan were not advanced, and no conclusion was reached regarding what social aspects should be included.

As part of the Work Programme, it was noted that there will be a stakeholder survey on social and economic aspects of the review of the plan, which will be carried out online and by telephone.

The draft conclusions of this meeting will now go to the STECF Spring Plenary meeting on 16 – 20 April. The secretariat will circulate the report once it is made available.

The Chair thanked Sean for his presentation and took comments from the floor. It was noted that:

- The concerns the NWWRAC has put on the table on this issue are being addressed by the EC, and that the work undertaken by the NWWRAC has made a significant contribution.
- There is a lack of expertise on a mixed fishery model. ICES is now looking into this for 2013.

Actions:

- **The Secretariat will request clarification from STECF on its meeting schedule and when the scoping of mixed fisheries plans for WoS, IS, West Channel and Celtic Sea will be dealt with.**
- **The Secretariat will also ask the Danish Fishermen's Association (coordinators of the initiative) what is the state of play in relation to the proposed Joint RAC seminar on mixed fisheries.**

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



Recommendation:

WG1 recommends to the Executive Committee that there should be a further meeting of the NWWRAC Focus Group on the Cod Recovery Plan sooner rather than later.

3. Technical Measures in Western Waters: West of Scotland

The Working Group discussed the new emergency measures which have removed haddock from the Catch Composition Rules. There appears to be no scope for application of similar technical conservation measures for cod and whiting, insofar as the Commission's position on these species has not changed. Members felt that a clear anomaly remained with the two regulations (especially concerning the cod 1.5% by-catch provision), with the added confusion of when co-decision procedure applies.

Members asked what the Commission's intention for whiting stocks in VIa was, and where we are now in relation to the Haddock LTMP.

The Commission representative said there was an ongoing discussion within the Commission on how to use analytical assessments or trends-based assessments for the setting of TACs. Decisions would be taken on a case-by-case basis.

The Commission also stated that they would like to see any future management plan to incorporate a multispecies approach. STECF have been requested to provide advice on multi species plans for the WoS and Irish Sea but that this advice will not be able to be developed until the October working group for the November Plenary at the earliest. It is likely that this advice will have impacts upon any proposal put forward in the interim.

Any adoption of a management plan in the short term (VIa haddock included) would be impacted by the current impasse between the Council and Parliament.

There were no actions or recommendations from this agenda item.

4. Fishing Opportunities for 2013

The Commission's Communication ("*policy statement*") on fishing opportunities for 2013 is expected to come out in May 2012, laying out its position on TACs and Quotas and effort levels. The Working Group asked the Commission for clarity on the EC's policy on data deficient stocks and automatic reductions.

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



The Commission representative answered that there was recognition that there are deficiencies with a too broad an approach given the differences between stock assessments and a case-by-case analysis may be required.

Members asked if the Commission's position on data deficient stocks would be revised in the new fishing opportunities document (i.e. rejecting the automatic reduction position), and if this document would lay out positions on an annual or multi-annual basis. Members asked for clarification on possible interpretation of Article 13 of TAC and quota regulation for 2012, and how this may affect the EC's reconsideration of automatic reductions.

Recommendation:

WG1 recommends to the Executive Committee that the NWWRAC should write to the Commission a letter asking for clarification on the legal reasons for effort regimes and not moving away from its approach of automatic reductions for data deficient stocks. The letter should also state what the NWWRAC hopes to see a change in the policy statement on Fishing Opportunities for 2013.

5. Data deficiency issues for stock assessments

There was an overview provided by the Secretariat and Barrie Deas on the main outcomes of MIRAC 2012 Meeting in The Hague (23-24 Jan 2012). The members heard that ICES is now fully engaged with the RACs on data deficiency work, and our initiative to appoint data coordinators is appreciated. It was noted that the SWWRAC has recently decided to take on the same kind of initiative.

The appointed stock data coordinators for WG1 to date are:

- Northern Hake (VI-VII) - Víctor Badiola
- Monkfish and Megrin VIa - Mike Park
- Cod VIa - Sean O'Donoghue
- Haddock VIa - Sean O'Donoghue and Alan Coghill
- Whiting VIa - Bertie Armstrong

ICES is currently working to establish a valid assessment methodology that gives a quantitative base for advice to underpin TAC recommendations for data deficient stocks. There will be further meetings in Lisbon that will look into this (WKPOOR and WKLIFE). In case that ICES agrees to give a quantitative approach, this might bring significant changes to next year's recommendations.

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



It seems now that changes have occurred and ICES has classified data deficient stocks into seven categories. The Working Group agreed that we should seek details about this new classification, and incorporate new stocks identified by ICES as data deficient in the ordinary NWWRAC work.

Actions:

- **The Secretariat will seek clarification from ICES on the new classification of data deficient stocks.**
- **Mike Park will report back from the ICES WKFLAT meeting in Bilbao (28 Feb – 8 March).**
- **The Secretariat will liaise with ICES to set up a follow-up meeting (WKDDRAC3) once substantial progress in data deficiency work is achieved by the NWWRAC.**

Recommendation:

WG1 recommends to the Executive Committee that the NWWRAC should request that the Commission consults the RACs on changes to the Data Collection Framework Regulation. It should also ask the Commission to clarify where it stands on the Long Term Management Plan for WoS Haddock, as its policy now is to move to multi-species plans.

6. Update on the MPA process in the West of Scotland area

JNCC gave a presentation on three areas of MPA work in the Working Group 1 area, covering:

1. Forthcoming Natura 2000 sites
2. An update on the Scottish MPA project
3. Proceedings from the Stanton Banks and Haig Fras SCIs fisheries management workshops

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



1. Natura 2000 sites – Tom Blasdale

Five new sites in offshore waters of Scotland have gone out for consultation, 4 of which are relevant to the Working Group 1. The areas are Hatton Bank (coincides with current NEAFC closure), East Rockall, Anton Dohrn Seamount, and Solan Bank.

The consultation runs from March 5th for 12 weeks, and proposals will be submitted to the Commission in October 2012. JNCC underlined that it was not allowed to use socioeconomic information for designating sites, as this was only appropriate when considering management measures. However, there was a government requirement for an Impact Assessment to estimate the cost of designation on fishing opportunities.

2. Scottish MPA Project – Sophie Elliott

In Scotland the process is underway to look at area based measures and identify Nature Conservation MPAs [under the Marine (Scotland) Act 2010], and options for completing a UK MPA network by 2012. So far, the science led approach had mapped the locations of MPA search features and identified possible areas of interest for discussion. Members have been invited to a workshop on MPA search locations in Edinburgh on 14-15 March, where stakeholders will look at additional search locations for features which have not yet been discussed. There will be a further workshop in May/June. A report will be submitted to the Scottish Ministers in November 2012, with site proposals following in 2013/14.

3. MAIA Project Workshops – Sophie Elliot

Stanton Bank and Haig Fraes are already designated sites and management of activities within the site boundaries are being now considered.

The Stanton Banks SCI Fisheries Management Measures Workshop in Glasgow last November would be followed up by:

- Discussion with static gear representatives that weren't present at the workshop (potters);
- Considerations of possible management boundaries with new survey and fishing data;
NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



- The management authorities to write proposals for the SCIs possible management measures
- Re-meeting stakeholders that attended the workshops following any changes any progress to the development of management measures;

The Chair thanked the JNCC representatives for their presentation and took comments from the floor.

Several WG1 members said there had been useful interaction with fishermen on the Hatton Bank project, and suggesting that if members had data available this should be put forward as it will be taken seriously and can make a difference. JNCC representatives said that they or their colleagues would be happy to come and speak to industry about its data sources.

There was a plea that industry from all Member States should be made aware of the long term vision of MPA projects in years to come, to gain an understanding of what European waters will look like in a number of years from now.

Members considered that MPAs can be introduced positively (with appropriate timeframes and comprehensive consultation) or negatively (“top down” cosmetic consultation). There is still scope for discussions on management and implementation of sites. If industry can provide plotter data, that would put fishers in a stronger position. Non-UK fleets with historical rights must also feel represented and consulted. It was felt that the approach taken in Scotland is better than the one taken in the rest of the United Kingdom.

JNCC reported that management measures offshore require compliance with CFP regulation and cannot be discriminatory but it must take full account of various Member State interests with historical rights, presence or activity in the area.

Action: WG1 members will continue their involvement in, and contributing data to, these MPA projects in UK waters.

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



7. Concluding remarks:

The WG1 Deputy Chairman, Víctor Badiola, thanked all the members and observers for attending the meeting, and the translators for their excellent work and closed the meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:00 h

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



ANNEX I. LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

<u>MEMBERS</u>		
<u>Name</u>	<u>Surname/s</u>	<u>Organization</u>
		Acting Chair <i>(replacing Jane Sandell)</i>
Víctor	Badiola	
		Rapporteur –
Kara	Brydson	RSPB / Birdlife International
Bertie	Armstrong	NWWRAC Chairman
Alan	Coghill	SFF / Orkney FPO
Juan Carlos	Corrás Arias	Pescagalicia-Arpega-Obarco
John	Crudden	European Anglers Association
Barrie	Deas	NFFO
André	Gueguen	OPOB-PMA-CNPMEM
John	Hermse	MNWFA
Jesús A.	Lourido García	Puerto de Celeiro S.A.
Francis	O’Donnell	Irish Fish PO
Sean	O’Donoghue	Kyllibegs FO

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



<u>MEMBERS (cont.)</u>		
<u>Name</u>	<u>Surname/s</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Eibhlin	O'Sullivan	Irish South West FPO
José Luis	Otero	Lonja de la Coruña S.A.
Michael	Park	SWFPA Ltd.
Jacques	Pichon	ANOP-PMA
Mercedes	Rodríguez Moreda	OPP-07-LUGO

<u>OBSERVERS</u>		
<u>Name</u>	<u>Surname/s</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Alain	Biseau	IFREMER
Tom	Blasdale	JNCC
Richard	Brouzes	OPBN
Therese	Cope	JNCC
Luc	Corbisier	SDVO
Debbie	Crockard	Seas at Risk
Sophie	Elliott	JNCC
David	Gatt	SWFPA Ltd.

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting

West of Scotland and Western Approaches

Paris, 28 February 2012



OBSERVERS (cont.)		
<u>Name</u>	<u>Surname/s</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Roy	Griffin	DG MARE –Commission
Luke	Jessop	DEFRA – UK
Eamon	Mangan	DPMEM – France
Laurent	Markovic	DG MARE –Commission
Joel	Vigneau	IFREMER / ICES WKCE

NWWRAC SECRETARIAT		
<u>Name</u>	<u>Surname/s</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Conor	Nolan	Executive Secretary
Alexandre	Rodríguez	Executive Assistant, Policy and Communications
Joanna	McGrath	Executive Assistant, Administration and Finances

NWWRAC Working Group 1 meeting
 West of Scotland and Western Approaches
 Paris, 28 February 2012