

## Non- Paper from the services of the European Commission

### Separating TAC areas for Plaice in VIId and in VIIe

#### Background

Plaice in VIIe and in VIId comprise two separate biological stocks, but they have been managed under a single TAC. This has engendered certain disadvantages. In particular, it is impossible to provide for different management responses to the perceived state of the stocks in the two areas in 2009. In Zone VIIe the stock is assessed as overfished and a substantial reduction in catch is needed to allow the stock to rebuild. In Zone VIId the situation is less clear as there is no acceptable analytic assessment, but it would appear that the stock is stable albeit at a low level. ICES and STECF advice allowed for maintaining landings at current levels.

Quotas are available only to BE, FR and UK in these areas.

Clearly, while the stocks are managed under a single TAC it is not possible to manage for catch reductions in one area while maintaining stable catches in the other. While technical measures such as closed areas might be pursued with this aim, it is generally hard to predict the outcome of such regulations because of the possibility of effort displacement and attendant unforeseeable circumstances.

It would be preferable, and relatively straightforward, to manage these stocks under separate TACs. Conventionally, ten-year averages of officially-reported catch statistics are used for such purposes, and the relevant Member States have indeed provided such statistics separately by area to ICES.

#### Allocation between VIId and VIIe

From 1999 until 2008 78.70 % of the catches were taken in zone VIId (Table 1). This percentage varied only slightly (range 72.70% to 81.97% in the period 1999 to 2008) and with no apparent trend. For the future, the TACs in these two areas would develop differently according to the different development of the biological stocks. It is not possible to predict this evolution.

The TAC for Zones VIIe was 4274t in 2010. For 2011, new TAC levels would be proposed according to the scientific advice for VIId and VIIe separately and by applying the rules in the forthcoming "Communication on Fishing Opportunities for 2011" with respect to the nominal references levels for 2010 as follows:

Zone	Historic Percentage	TAC in 2010	Reference values for Calculation of 2011 TAC
VIId	78.70%	4274t	3364t
VIIe	21.30%		910t

## **New allocations within VIId and within VIIe**

Currently, the three Member States concerned (BE, FR, UK) have the same relative fishing opportunities in VIId as in VIIe. However, they have chosen to use these opportunities differently. The recent catch histories reported by the Member States to ICES in the two areas are presented in Tables 2 and 3 (in tonnes) and in Tables 4 and 5 (in percentage terms).

These data are tabulated in Annex, from ICES advice for 2010. Reported catches are given in Tables 1 to 4.

However, these reported catches reflect the use of quota allocations as modified by quota transfers. It is necessary to adjust for such transfers. Reported transfers are given in Table 6. Adjustments were made to the catch data in Tables 1 to 4 in the following way.

1. A quantity of fish equal to the quota transfer was subtracted from reported catches of the recipient Member State and added to the reported catches of the donor Member State.
2. This quantity was split between VIId and VIIe in the same ratio as the reported catches of the donor Member State. In other words, when correcting for the transfer it is assumed that the donor Member State would have used the quota it had transferred according to its usual fishing pattern, and not that actually used by the recipient Member State.
3. The additions and subtractions mentioned in 1. above were calculated separately for areas VIId and VIIe.
4. Where a subtraction resulted in a negative catch for either VIId or VIIe, the catch was set to zero and the quantity was subtracted from the catch in the other area.

The results of these adjustment calculations are set out in Tables 7 to 10. In some cases, transfers were made to Member States whose catches do not appear in ICES catch reports. On correcting for such transfers (e.g. 30t transferred from UK to IE in 2001), the total of the catches from the two areas increases by the corresponding amount.

It is clear that fishing patterns are very different in the two areas. In VIId, FR and BE take most of the catches while in VIIe UK takes over three-quarters of the catches and the BE catch is very small. These patterns are quite stable over time.

On partitioning Zone VIIde into zones VIId and VIIe, it could be argued that each Member State should retain its current fishing rights in each area and that the current allocation key should apply in the two new areas. This would impose a need to change current fishing patterns as, for example, BE could no longer continue to take virtually all of its quota in VIId.

A solution could be developed based on preserving fishing patterns in the last ten years. New allocation keys could be developed based on the percentages in the last lines of Tables 8 and 10.

## **Conclusion**

The Commission sees a clear need to manage the plaice stocks in VIIe and VIId separately according to biological advice. However, the Commission takes no position on allocation questions among Member States. Calculations presented here are intended only to assist Member States and interested parties in their deliberations.

## Plaice VIII

Table 2. Catches of plaice in VIII, from catches reported to ICES.

Year	BE	FR	UK	Total
1999	1306	3194	743	5243
2000	1298	3183	752	5233
2001	1348	2962	655	4963
2002	1204	3454	841	5499
2003	995	2783	756	4534
2004	987	2439	580	4006
2005	830	1756	411	2997
2006	1031	1713	545	3289
2007	1356	1858	460	3674
2008	1388	1642	461	3491
Average				4292,9

## Plaice VIIe

Table 4. Catches of plaice in VIIe, from catches reported to ICES.

Year	BE	FR	UK	Total
1999	12	194	947	1153
2000	4	360	926	1290
2001	12	303	797	1112
2002	27	242	978	1247
2003	39	216	985	1240
2004	46	184	912	1142
2005	48	198	887	1133
2006	52	223	966	1241
2007	84	201	677	962
2008	66	105	669	840
Average				1136

Table 3. Catches of plaice in VIII: percentage distribution by Member State

Year	BE	FR	UK	Total
1999	24,91%	60,92%	14,17%	100,00%
2000	24,80%	60,83%	14,37%	100,00%
2001	27,12%	59,68%	13,20%	100,00%
2002	21,89%	62,81%	15,29%	100,00%
2003	21,95%	61,38%	16,67%	100,00%
2004	24,64%	60,88%	14,48%	100,00%
2005	27,69%	58,59%	13,71%	100,00%
2006	31,35%	52,08%	16,57%	100,00%
2007	36,91%	50,57%	12,52%	100,00%
2008	39,76%	47,04%	13,21%	100,00%
Mean	28,1021%	57,4784%	14,4195%	100,00%

Table 5. Catches of plaice in VIIe: percentage distribution by Member State

Year	BE	FR	UK	Total
1999	1,04%	16,83%	82,13%	100,00%
2000	0,31%	27,91%	71,78%	100,00%
2001	1,08%	27,25%	71,67%	100,00%
2002	2,17%	19,41%	78,43%	100,00%
2003	3,15%	17,42%	79,44%	100,00%
2004	4,03%	16,11%	79,86%	100,00%
2005	4,24%	17,48%	78,29%	100,00%
2006	4,19%	17,97%	77,84%	100,00%
2007	8,73%	20,89%	70,37%	100,00%
2008	7,86%	12,50%	79,64%	100,00%
Mean	3,6784%	19,3758%	76,9458%	100,00%

Table 1. Catches of plaice in VIId and in VIle, from catches reported to ICES.

Year	VIId		VIle	
	tonnes	%	tonnes	%
1999	5243	81,97	1153	18,027
2000	5233	80,22	1290	19,776
2001	4963	81,70	1112	18,305
2002	5499	81,51	1247	18,485
2003	4534	78,52	1240	21,476
2004	4006	77,82	1142	22,183
2005	3017	72,70	1133	27,301
2006	3305	72,70	1241	27,299
2007	3674	79,25	962	20,751
2008	3491	80,60	840	19,395
Average		78,700		21,300

Table 6. Calculation of new allocation keys for VIId and in VIIe

	Hypothetical situation for 2010					Actual 2010 Quotas	
	VIId		VIIe		Sum of quotas in VIId+VIIe		
	New Key (%)	Quota (t)	New Key (%)	Quota (t)			
BE	28,1021	945	3,6784	33	978	699	
FR	57,4784	1934	19,3758	176	2110	2332	
UK	14,4195	485	76,9458	700	1185	1243	
Total	100	3364	100	910	4273	4274	

Table 6. Transfers of place in Vilde between Member States, 1999-2008.

1999		Transfer to			
		UK	FR	BE	NL
Transfer From	UK	120			
	FR				
	BE				
	NL				
	IE				

  

2000		Transfer to				
		UK	FR	BE	NL	IE
Transfer From	UK	93				
	FR					
	BE					
	NL					
	IE					

  

2001		Transfer to				
		UK	FR	BE	NL	IE
Transfer From	UK	25		116		30
	FR					
	BE					
	NL					
	IE					

  

2002		Transfer to				
		UK	FR	BE	NL	IE
Transfer From	UK	75				
	FR	15				
	BE					
	NL					
	IE					

  

2003		Transfer to				
		UK	FR	BE	NL	IE
Transfer From	UK	5				
	FR	1				
	BE	58				
	NL					
	IE					

  

2004		Transfer to				
		UK	FR	BE	NL	IE
Transfer From	UK	1				
	FR					
	BE	15				
	NL					
	IE					

  

2005		Transfer to				
		UK	FR	BE	NL	IE
Transfer From	UK	20				
	FR	1				
	BE					
	NL					
	IE					

  

2006		Transfer to				
		UK	FR	BE	NL	IE
Transfer From	UK	1				
	FR	100				
	BE	20				
	NL					
	IE					

  

2007		Transfer to				
		UK	FR	BE	NL	IE
Transfer From	UK	40				
	FR	440				
	BE	20				
	NL	40				
	IE					

  

2008		Transfer to				
		UK	FR	BE	NL	IE
Transfer From	UK	125				
	FR	25	370			
	BE	20				
	NL					
	IE					

## Plaice VIId

Table 7. Catches of plaice in VIId, from catches reported to ICES.  
Values adjusted for quota transfers

Year	BE	FR	UK	Total	
1999	1198	3194	796	5188	
2000	1209	3183	794	5186	
2001	1242	2951	732	4925	
2002	1204	3454	883	5541	
2003	1051	2783	703	4537	
2004	1001	2439	580	4020	
2005	830	1757	418	3005	
2006	954	1802	546	3302	
2007	885	2255	492	3632	
2008	935	2013	502	3450	
Average				4278,6	

## Plaice VIle

Table 9. Catches of plaice in VIle, from catches reported to ICES.  
Values adjusted for quota transfers

Year	BE	FR	UK	Total	
1999	0	194	1014	1208	
2000	0	360	977	1337	
2001	0	289	891	1180	
2002	27	242	1026	1295	
2003	41	216	986	1243	
2004	47	184	913	1144	
2005	48	198	901	1147	
2006	48	234	967	1249	
2007	55	244	725	1024	
2008	44	129	728	901	
Average				1172,8	

Table 8. Catches of plaice in VIId: percentage distribution by Member State  
Values adjusted for quota transfers

Year	BE	FR	UK	Total
1999	23,09%	61,57%	15,34%	100,00%
2000	23,31%	61,38%	15,31%	100,00%
2001	25,22%	59,92%	14,86%	100,00%
2002	21,73%	62,34%	15,94%	100,00%
2003	23,17%	61,34%	15,49%	100,00%
2004	24,90%	60,67%	14,43%	100,00%
2005	27,62%	58,47%	13,91%	100,00%
2006	28,89%	54,57%	16,54%	100,00%
2007	24,37%	62,09%	13,55%	100,00%
2008	27,10%	58,35%	14,55%	100,00%
Mean	24,9398%	60,0685%	14,9917%	100,00%

Table 10. Catches of plaice in VIId: percentage distribution by Member State  
Values adjusted for quota transfers

Year	BE	FR	UK	Total
1999	0,00%	16,06%	83,94%	100,00%
2000	0,00%	26,93%	73,07%	100,00%
2001	0,00%	24,49%	75,51%	100,00%
2002	2,08%	18,69%	79,23%	100,00%
2003	3,30%	17,38%	79,32%	100,00%
2004	4,11%	16,08%	79,81%	100,00%
2005	4,18%	17,26%	78,55%	100,00%
2006	3,84%	18,73%	77,42%	100,00%
2007	5,37%	23,83%	70,80%	100,00%
2008	4,88%	14,32%	80,80%	100,00%
Mean	2,7774%	19,3769%	77,8457%	100,00%