



North Western Waters Regional Advisory Council
HORIZONTAL WORKING GROUP MEETING ON CFP REFORM
Dublin Castle, 27th October 2010

REPORT

Chair: Lorcan Ó Cinnéide

Rapporteur: Barrie Deas

1. Introduction – Lorcan O’Cinnéide

The Chairman introduced the meeting, indicating that its focus would be CFP reform and in particular regionalisation and governance. The intention was to build on the NWWRAC response to the CFP reform consultation.

There appeared to be widespread support for a decentralisation and regionalisation of the CFP; however many practical and legal aspects of a regionalised CFP were still far from clear. The objective of the meeting was to discuss the issues and if possible work towards drawing up a position paper which could eventually influence the emerging proposals.

2. Setting the scene: external presentations from speakers

In order to prepare the ground for a productive dialogue, three important experts had been invited to make presentations:

2.1. Review of actions undertaken by the DG MARE in 2010 - Isabelle Viallon

http://www.nwwrac.org/admin/publication/upload/DG_MARE_Presentation_CFP_Reform_State_Play_IV_271010_EN.pdf

The Commission’s representative, Ms. Viallon, provided an overview of the responses to the CFP reform consultation, the next steps in the reform process, and an approximate timetable.

Horizontal WG meeting on CFP Reform

Dublin Castle, 27/10/2010



The consultation had revealed overwhelming support for regionalisation of the CFP but there was a range of views about what it might mean in practice. A range of options were available. At one end of the continuum was the application of a kind of delegated responsibility through which member states would hold a central and formal role, through to member states in coordinated but relatively informal collective administration.

If a formal management body was established, important questions about the composition of such groups would have to be addressed.

In response to a question from the Chairman, Ms. Viallon clarified that while the formal consultation process on the Green Paper is closed, that the Commission is in "listening mode" and receptive to inputs and perspectives.

2.2. Legal and institutional framework for the RACs - Dr. Ronán Long, New University of Ireland, Galway

http://www.nwwrac.org/admin/publication/upload/RONAN_LONG_Presentation_Legal_Framework_RAC_27_1010_EN.pdf

The key points in Dr. Long's presentation were:

- The work of the Nobel Prize winner in economics, Prof. Elinor Ostrom, illustrated the fact that rules made with stakeholder participation were generally more effective in achieving their objectives than those imposed from outside;
- The current CFP is a framework that does not give sufficient responsibility to the industry;
- There is a perceived need to strengthen legitimacy, transparency and efficiency;
- It is important to take fully into account the implications of both the Lisbon Treaty and the Integrated Maritime Policy;
- It is quite clear that law making resides with the European institutions and the supremacy of EU law and the Commission's right of initiative remain intact.

Horizontal WG meeting on CFP Reform

Dublin Castle, 27/10/2010



Against this background, Dr Long suggested three possible options, for a decentralised decision making framework, all with strengths and weaknesses:

1. Delegation to the Commission (Comitology);
2. Delegation of implementing decisions to member states (Regional management solution);
3. Delegation of powers to an autonomous regulatory body.

2.3. MEFEPO Project: Survey on stakeholders views on capacities and functioning of the RACs – Dr. Troels J. Hegland, Institute of Innovative Fisheries Management, Aalborg University

http://www.nwwrac.org/admin/publication/upload/MEFEPO_Regionalisation_Fisheries_Policy_DC_271010_TJH_EN.pdf

Dr. Hegland used the results of a survey conducted by the MEFEPO project to highlight the governance options available for a regionalised CFP. These were:

- Regional Fisheries Management
- Regional Fisheries Co-management
- Cooperative member state council model

Different models of regionalisation, differing perceptions of them, key differences between the “most feasible” models and key issues for the RACs were discussed.

3. Discussion

Members of the Working Group raised a number of questions of the guest presenters:

- Should regional management be given effect through a formalised arrangement or through informal pragmatic cooperation?

Horizontal WG meeting on CFP Reform

Dublin Castle, 27/10/2010

- Will regionalisation offer genuine opportunities to move towards co-management or will it represent a further layer of bureaucracy?
- Which responsibilities/decisions should be placed at the regional level?
- What impact would the Marine Strategy Framework Directive have on CFP decisions within a reformed and regionalised CFP?
- What would the hierarchy of responsibilities be within a reformed and regionalised CFP?
- Is there scope for RACS, strengthened and broadened to include scientists and member state fisheries managers to form the regional bodies?

4. What do we want from a regionalised CFP?

It was agreed that it was clear from the presentations that there were different models of a regionalised CFP, some of greater relevance than others. One way that the RAC could provide advice on the subject would be to list the NWWRAC's priorities for what such a body might be expected to deliver. This would in turn help us to define the characteristics required in a regional body and the matching political structure to deliver these aspirations.

As a provisional and non-exhaustive list of RAC requirements, the following could be suggested:

- Customised solutions that would deliver more effective fisheries management, and help to achieve Maximum Sustainable Yield (accepting the limitations of that concept in mixed fisheries)
- A move away from prescriptive micro-management
- Simplification of the CFP
- A move to responsive and adaptive management that would allow us to move rapidly away from failed measures and trial new approaches
- Decisions made at the lowest practicable level
- Progressively develop *delegated authority* as a means of transferring responsibilities to the fishing industry within a framework of guarantees and safeguards



- Oversee the preparation, coordination development and approval of long term management plans, working closely with the RACs
- Maintain a close, continuous, dialogue and engagement with the RACs
- Select and refine management measures from the fisheries management “toolbox” to fit the circumstances
- Manage trans-boundary issues
- Alignment of economic incentives with management objectives so as to avoid perverse outcomes
- Results focused management
- Provide a forum bringing fisheries managers from the relevant member states, fisheries scientists and fisheries stakeholders into close and continuous contact to decide on the content of legislative proposals (accepting the realities of the legal context – the Commission’s right of initiative and the Council’s and the European Parliament’s final right of approval)
- Improve the information base on which management decisions and recommendations are made

5. Way Forward

It was agreed that there was a broad consensus that the RACs had emerged as one of the most successful parts of the 2002 reform. Whatever form that regional management eventually took, the RACs, possibly strengthened and enhanced, would be the main interlocutor with the new management bodies, whatever form they take.

In developing a regionalised CFP, it was considered important to avoid adding a further tier of bureaucracy which served no purpose and increased rather than reduced distance between stakeholders and decision makers.

Bringing maximum benefit to most people and maintaining, sustaining and developing fishing communities as well as promoting effective and responsive fisheries management should be touchstones for the new regional bodies.

Horizontal WG meeting on CFP Reform

Dublin Castle, 27/10/2010



6. Next Steps

The Chairman concluded that:

- The record of the meeting would be useful as the basis for a further focus group meeting, the aim of which would be to prepare and agree a position paper on regional management
- It might be desirable to invite the contributions of other RACs and the European Parliament;
- Depending on availability, it would be helpful if Dr. Ronan Long could continue to contribute to the RAC's deliberations on this issue.

The meeting was adjourned at 17 h

Horizontal WG meeting on CFP Reform

Dublin Castle, 27/10/2010

Annex I. List of Participants

NWWRAC Horizontal WG on CFP Reform– Dublin Castle, 27 October 2010			
Name	Surname/s	Organisation	Membership Status
Víctor	Badiola	OPPAO, Spain	Member
Iwan	Ball	WWF-Wales, UK	Member
Jacques	Bigot	ETF / CFTC, France	Member
Emiel	Brouckaert	Rederscentrale, Belgium	Member
Richard	Brouzes	Copeport Maree OPBN, France	Member
Tom	Bryan-Brown	Manx Fish Producer's Organisation, UK	Member
Kara	Brydson	RSPB Scotland-Birdlife International	Member
Alan	Coghill	Scottish Fishermen's Federation, UK	Member
Luc	Corbisier	SDVO, Belgium	Member
John	Crudden	European Anglers Alliance, EU	Member
Bruno	Dachicourt	France Pêche Durable et Responsable, France	Member
John	Daly	Irish Seal Sanctuary, Ireland	Observer

Horizontal WG meeting on CFP Reform

Dublin Castle, 27/10/2010

NWWRAC Horizontal WG on CFP Reform - Dublin Castle, 27 October 2010

Name	Surname/s	Organisation	Membership Status
Barrie	Deas	National Federation of Fishermen's Organisation, UK	Member - Rapporteur
Clara	Fernández	Community Fisheries Control Agency, EU	Observer
Caroline	Gamblin	CNPMEM, France	Member
Hugo	González	ANASOL-ARVI, Spain	Member
Béatrice	Harmel	CRPBN, France	Observer
Troels Jacob	Hegland	IFM University of Aalborg, Denmark	Speaker
Sam	Lambourn	NWWRAC Chairman	Chairman, NWWRAC
André	LeBerre	NWWRAC President	President, NWWRAC
Daniel	Lefèvre	CRPBN, France	Member
Ronán	Long	NUI Galway, Ireland	Speaker
Jesús	Lourido Garcia	Puerto de Celeiro S.A., Spain	Member
Joe	Maddock	Irish Fishermen's Organisation	Member
Kevin	McDonnell	West of Scotland FPO, UK	Member
Joanna	McGrath	NWWRAC Secretariat	NWWRAC Secretariat

Horizontal WG meeting on CFP Reform

Dublin Castle, 27/10/2010

NWWRAC Horizontal WG on CFP Reform - Dublin Castle, 27 October 2010

Name	Surname/s	Organisation	Membership Status
Eduardo	Míguez	EAFPA, EU	Member
Jonathan	Moore	ClientEarth	Observer
Conor	Nolan	NWWRAC Secretariat	NWWRAC Secretariat
Lorcán	O’Cinnéide	Irish Fish Producers Organisation, Ireland	Member - Chairman
Catherine	Pederson	Irish Environmental Network, Ireland	Observer
Jacques	Pichon	ANOP, France	Member
Jim	Portus	South West Fish Producer's Organisation, UK	Member
Eibhlin	O'Sullivan	Irish South & West FPO, Ireland	Member
Brendan	Price	Irish Seal Sanctuary, Ireland	Member
Mercedes	Rodríguez Moreda	OPP-07-LUGO, Spain	Member
Alexandre	Rodriguez	NWWRAC Secretariat	NWWRAC Secretariat
Paul	Trebilcock	Cornish Fish Producers Organisation	Member
Isabelle	Viallon	DG MARE – European Commission	Speaker
John	Woodlock	Irish Seal Sanctuary	Member

Horizontal WG meeting on CFP Reform

Dublin Castle, 27/10/2010