



CONSEIL CONSULTATIF POUR
LES EAUX OCCIDENTALES
SEPTENTRIONALES

NORTH WESTERN
WATERS
ADVISORY COUNCIL

CONSEJO CONSULTIVO PARA
LAS AGUAS
NOROCCIDENTALES

MINUTES

WORKING GROUP 1 (WEST OF SCOTLAND)

CNPMEM, Paris
Wednesday 1st of March 2017
09:00 – 10:00

1. Welcome and introductions

The acting WG1 Chairman, Alan Coghill, welcomed the members and the attendees to the meeting. The full list of participants is included as an annex to these minutes.

The agenda¹ was adopted as drafted. The following action points from the last meeting in Edinburgh (6th July 2016) had been completed:

- The meeting agreed to look for further participants to the MAREFRAME meeting on the 25th of August 2016;
- Secretariat to forward information from the EC on the political agreement on Deep Sea fisheries management to AC members;
- Mr McLeod to provide the areas of importance defined by the NGOs and Fishermen (i.e. the lines that were drawn) during the last workshop, to show the AC how discussions have progressed.

2. Appointment of chair

Following the retirement of Ross Dougal the Working Group was asked to nominate a new chair. The acting Chair asked the Group for nominations, noting that in the past, WG1 had a UK chair and Spanish Vice-chairs.

No nominations were put forward, and the Group was asked to consider the situation and put forward nominations before the next meeting in July.

ACTION: WG1 members to inform the Secretariat on nominations for the Chair of the Group.

¹ All documents relevant to the meeting can be found on the NWWAC website: [link](#)

3. Developments of Marine Protected Areas (MPAs)

Michael McLeod (Marine Scotland) presented the latest MPA proposals for the West of Scotland, outlining changes to the proposals in North Western Waters and providing an overview of the updated analysis on economics and displacement. It was the intention of the Scottish administration to publish the updated proposals in early March, at which time other Member States would be invited to confirm that sufficient information had been presented to begin the formal negotiation period. It was the intention to submit the final Joint Recommendations to the Commission before the end of October.

Mr McLeod highlighted that:

- There were 8 sites in offshore waters; 4 SACs and 4 national MPAs designated under the MSFD;
- The proposals for 2 sites had been updated since the last presentation;
- An updated fishing effort analysis had been completed, which had included information provided by the AC.

The proposed management measures (including site details) and the audit, a description of the development of the proposals and feedback and advice from the JNCC would be made available on the Marine Scotland website.

The presentation highlighted changes made to two sites based on the previous consultation:

1. Solan bank reef

It was proposed that:

- The whole site (including hatched areas) be closed to mobile gear, all year;
- A derogation for haddock fisheries in September and October, be permitted in a larger area than previously proposed for trawl and seine fisheries.

2. Wyville Thomson Ridge

It was proposed that:

- A small increase be made to the closed area for mobile gear
 - Based on an analysis of 2011 to 2015 effort, it was considered that this would not impact fishing opportunities.

An assessment of the effects of the proposals for all sites was presented to show changes to the fishing footprint based on VMS data, which showed that the proposed management rules had a low impact on UK mobile gears, and a modest impact on non-UK mobile gears. The latter was mainly due to the Deep Sea Access Regulation, and not the proposed management measures. Static gear would only be affected in the Rosemary bank site.

Documentation would be made available on the Marine Scotland website², including the proposals with the site details and the Audit with explanations on how the proposals had evolved. The AC would be informed when the updated version was published.

Mr McLeod then opened to the floor for questions:

Kenny Coull noted that members of the Scottish Fishermen's Federation agreed that the stakeholder engagement and scientific basis of the process had been good, which meant that the process offered a good opportunity to discuss practical proposals.

² <http://www.gov.scot/Topics/marine/marine-environment/mpanetwork/SACmanagement/Offshore2017>

Juan Carlos Corrás considered there were too many protected areas, which restricted fishing, especially below 800m depth and, therefore, opposed the closing of areas to fishing activity. He noted that there were many management measures, which jeopardised fishing activities, and the addition of MPAs was yet another way to hinder fishing, especially trawling activity. He considered that the closed area around the Rosemary bank for static gears was much wider than the protected features. He warned that with more closed areas, that the displacement of fishing effort would generate problems.

Julien Lamothe commented on the difference between the English and Scottish stakeholder consultation process regarding MPAs. He appreciated the way the Scottish process had taken stakeholder input into account, and concluded that the proposal was a balance between protecting habitat and fishing activities.

Alex Kinninmonth also welcomed the level of stakeholder engagement and transparency in the decision making process, as well as the good scientific background and support from JNCC. While recognising that there were still areas of disagreement he hoped that the AC could agree with this proposal and supported an adaptive and transparent process in the future.

The Chair thanked Mr McLeod for his presentation and indicated that the AC would await notice of the next stage in the process.

4. Effects of the Landing Obligation in the West of Scotland

In preparation for the Horizontal Working Group on the Landing Obligation (HWGLO) the WG was asked to share experiences and specific examples of the implementation of the landing obligation (LO) in the past year for the West of Scotland.

The Chair noted that from the perspective of his PO, 2016 had been a peculiar year as haddock had been in short supply and as a result there had been less pressure on the West of Scotland than normal. Since only a small number of stocks were under the LO so far, little effect had been seen. He expected that the *Nephrops* fleet would be influenced in future.

Sean O'Donoghue agreed that the haddock shortage in 2016 had meant that the LO had not caused major problems. This might change in 2017, since the haddock assessment included both a mistake and a change to the reference points, which had taken place at a benchmark without wider consultation. The advice for the stock had resulted in a TAC reduction of more than 40% and shortages and significant problems were predicted as a result. He stressed that the full impact of the LO will be felt in 2019, when the zero-TAC stocks (e.g. cod) would create major problems. Choke scenarios caused by zero-TAC stocks should be looked at specifically when discussing the expansion of the choke toolbox.

Norman Graham (EC) agreed that zero-TAC stocks would be a significant problem and urged the Advisory Council to think collectively about innovative measures to reduce bycatch and choke risks, referring to the spurdog avoidance behaviour study as an example. An informal meeting of Fisheries Directors was planned in Malta at the end of March to discuss choke species. He hoped to foster dialogue between MS and ACs to deal with the provision in CFP to develop mitigation measures. He encouraged input from the ACs in these developments.

Mr O'Donoghue recalled that the AC had developed management plans for cod and whiting in the

past, which had provided practical proposals, including control and enforcement options³. Although these had not been adopted by the EC or Member States in the past, he suggested that this proposal should be revisited as the fundamental elements remained relevant. The Chair proposed that the WG approve this proposal and this was agreed unanimously by the members present.

Bruno Leduc noted that an additional issue in the area concerned the bycatch of cod in saithe fisheries in the North Sea and the West of Scotland. Since avoidance would not always be possible there was a risk of catches being misreported as being taken in Faroese waters in order to “balance” catches. He stressed the need for fishermen to be able to do their work safely.

The Chair noted the action point and asked the Secretariat to ensure that a summary of the discussions on the LO be transmitted to the ADGLO.

ACTION: The input from the Working Group to be summarised and provided to the HWGLO.

ACTION: WG1 to update the NWWAC management plan proposals for cod and whiting.

5. MAREFRAME project

The Secretariat (Barbara Schoute) presented a brief progress report. The NWWAC is a partner in the MAREFRAME project, which has developed a decision support tool for the West of Scotland ecosystem. Two models were under development, one of which is nearly operational. The team of scientists involved in the project had extended an invitation to stakeholders to join them in finalising the results and improve the scenarios they had been testing. They proposed that a web-meeting be organised in the near future in order to get stakeholder feedback, and that a face-to-face workshop be held in the second quarter of the year to bring together the most involved stakeholders. It was suggested that the workshop could be combined with other topics e.g. the implementation of the LO for zero-TAC stocks and the AC had been informed that funding would be available for such a workshop through the MAREFRAME project. WG1 members were asked for feedback on their experiences with the project.

Kevin McDonnell commented that he had attended the last 3 project meetings, and reported that industry members had provided a moderate amount of input. He stressed that the project would benefit from input from other stakeholders and suggested that NGO members should become engaged in the project to help progress and develop the models.

The Chair concluded that WG members should help to finalise the project and members were asked to inform the Secretariat if they were interested in participating in the workshop.

ACTION: WG members to suggest alternative scenarios for future MAREFRAME work.

ACTION: WG members to inform the Secretariat if they are interested in taking part in a workshop; Industry members specifically encourage members of other interest groups to engage with the process.

³ [NWWAC DECLARATION VIa COD 14Dec2012 EN](#),
[NWWAC Position Paper Future Cod Recovery 15June2012 EN.pdf](#)

6. Summary by the Chair of actions agreed and decisions adopted

1	WG1 members to inform the Secretariat on nominations for the Chair of the Group.
2	The input from the Working Group to be summarised and provided to the HWGLO.
3	WG1 to update the NWWAC management plan proposals for cod and whiting.
4	WG members to suggest alternative scenarios for future MAREFRAME work.
5	WG members to inform the Secretariat if they are interested in taking part in a workshop; Industry members specifically encourage members of other interest groups to engage with the process.

NWWAC Document
Chairman: Alan Coghill
Rapporteur: Debbie Crockard
Review and editing: Barbara Schoute
Final revision: Conor P. Nolan

Annex 1 – List of Participants

NWWAC members		
Alan	Coghill	Orkney Fish Producers Organisation
Alex	Kinninmonth	Stichting BirdLife Europe, represented by the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds
Javier	López	Oceana
John	Crudden	European Anglers Alliance
Marina	Le Gurun	Blue Fish
Vera	Coulho	The Pew Charitable Trusts
Caroline	Gamblin	CNPMEM, Comité National des Pêches Maritimes et des Élevages Marins
Julien	Lamothe	Association Nationale des Organisations de Producteurs
Julien	Lamothe	Les Pêcheurs de Bretagne LPDB
Bruno	Leduc	Union des armateurs de la pêche en France
Francis	O'Donnell	Irish Fish Producers Organisation
John	Lynch	Irish Fishermen's Organisation
Sean	O'Donoghue	Killybegs Fishermen's Organisation
José	Beltran	Organización de Productores Pesqueros de Lugo (OPP-7)
José Luis	Otero Gonzalez	Lonja de La Coruña S.A.
Juan Carlos	Corrás Arias	Pescagalicia-Arpega-Obarco
Luis Francisco	Marín	Organización de Productores de Pesca de Ondarroa
Purificación	Fernández Alvarez	Asociación Nacional de Armadores de Buques de Pesca de Gran Sol
Kenny	Coull	Scottish Fishermen's Federation
Kevin	McDonnell	West of Scotland Fish Producers Organisation
Peter	Smith	Scottish Fishermen's Organisation
Observers		
Norman	Graham	European Commission
Erwan	Quemeneur	CDPMEM du Finistère, Comité Départemental des Pêches Maritimes et des Élevages Marins 29
Edward	Farrell	School of Biology & Environmental Science, University College Dublin
Juana	Poza Poza	Ministerio de Agricultura, Alimentacion y Medio Ambiente
Emily	Baxter	North West Wildlife Trusts
Michael	McLeod	Marine Scotland - Marine planning and policy
Liane	Veitch	ClientEarth
Ken	Kawahara	PPPAF
Rachel	Bower	JNCC
Olivier	Le Nezet	CRPMEM Bretagne
David	Beard	Manx Fish Producer Organisation
Despina	Symons	EBCD
Sinead	Cummins	Birdwatch Ireland
Severino	Ares Lago	Fundación Rendemento Económico Mínimo Sostible e Social
William	Stuart	EFCA
Debbie	Crockard	Seas at Risk
NWWAC Secretariat		
Conor	Nolan	Executive Secretary
Barbara	Schoute	Deputy Executive Secretary
Sara	Vandamme	Project Development and Communications Manager